

### governmentattic.org

"Rummaging in the government's attic"

Description of document: Commodity Futures Trading Commission (CFTC)

Administrative Processing Files Regarding Five (5) FOIA Requests Concerning CFTC Investigations Into Allegations

of Manipulation of the Silver Market, 2013-2016

Requested date: 16-September-2015

Released date: 23-February-2016

Posted date: 14-March-2016

Source of document: Freedom of Information Act Request

**FOIA Compliance Office** 

**Commodity Futures Trading Commission** 

Three Lafayette Centre 1155 21st Street NW Washington, DC 20581

Email: FOIASubmissions@cftc.gov

The governmentattic.org web site ("the site") is noncommercial and free to the public. The site and materials made available on the site, such as this file, are for reference only. The governmentattic.org web site and its principals have made every effort to make this information as complete and as accurate as possible, however, there may be mistakes and omissions, both typographical and in content. The governmentattic.org web site and its principals shall have neither liability nor responsibility to any person or entity with respect to any loss or damage caused, or alleged to have been caused, directly or indirectly, by the information provided on the governmentattic.org web site or in this file. The public records published on the site were obtained from government agencies using proper legal channels. Each document is identified as to the source. Any concerns about the contents of the site should be directed to the agency originating the document in question. GovernmentAttic.org is not responsible for the contents of documents published on the website.



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

February 23, 2016

RE: 15-00221-FOIA

Records associated with the following specified CFTC FOIA Cases: 14-00001-FOIA 14-00003-FOIA 14-00016-FOIA 14-00031-

FOIA 14-00076-FOIA

This is in response to your request dated September 16, 2015 under the Freedom of Information Act seeking access to a copy of each piece of correspondence, including interim correspondence, associated with the following specified CFTC FOIA cases:

14-00001-FOIA 14-00003-FOIA 14-00031-FOIA 14-00076-FOIA

In an email to me dated February 22, 2016, you clarified that you are not seeking the underlying records for those FOIAs. In accordance with the FOIA and agency policy, we have searched our records, as of September 16, 2015, the date we received your request in our FOIA office.

We have located 82 responsive records. You are granted full access to the responsive records, which are enclosed.

If you are not satisfied with this response to your request, you may appeal by writing to Freedom of Information Act Appeal, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Centre, 8<sup>th</sup> Floor, 1155 21st Street, N.W., Washington, D.C. 20581, within 30 days of the date of this letter. Please enclose a copy of your original request and a copy of this response.

If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact me at 202-418-5192.

Sincerely,

Candace Ambrose

Attorney Advisor

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

October 17, 2013

Christian Berthelsen The Wall Street Journal 1211 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10036

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Dear Mr. Berthelsen:

This letter acknowledges the receipt of your Freedom of Information Act request dated October 11, 2013 for the documents listed below:

Copies of any records pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of manipulation in the silver market.

If you should have any questions regarding your request, please contact me at 202-418-5497. In any call or future correspondence concerning the request, please refer to the following case number 14-00001-FOIA.

Sincerely,

Linda J. Mauldin Paralegal Specialist



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

March 24, 2014

Christian Berthelsen The Wall Street Journal 1211 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver market price manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen:

This is our first response to your request dated October 11, 2013, under the Freedom of Information Act seeking access to copies of any records, documents, files, reports, emails, or other written or recorded communications and records or evidence pertaining to the Commission's investigation into allegations of manipulation in the silver market. This would include, but is not limited to, the Commission's official case file, recordings or transcripts of the Commission's weekly market monitoring meeting at which the investigation was discussed and any reports generated by independent consultants or other outside experts contracted to review evidence collected during the inquiry. In accordance with the FOIA and agency policy, we have searched our records, as of October 17, 2013, the date we received your request in our FOIA office.

We have reviewed 223 pages of responsive records thus far, and we are continuing to review additional records. For this production, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, 37 pages of accessible records. Portions of these pages, as well as 186 fully exempt pages, fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Portions of the 223 responsive pages are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirement by FOIA Exemptions 3 and 4. First, some information is exempt under Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), because it is exempt from disclosure by another statute. Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers. Second, some information is exempt from disclosure under Exemption 4, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4), because it constitutes confidential commercial or financial information. See also Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Other portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 5. The exempted portions contain staff analyses, opinions, or recommendations, which are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making processes. 5 U.S.C.

§ 552(b)(5); see also NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Finally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 37 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

oan E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

March 24, 2014

Damien Lazar
The Brattle Group
44 Brattle Street
Cambridge, MA 02138
Damien.Lazar@brattle.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA; 14-00003-FOIA; 14-00031-FOIA Silver market price manipulation

Dear Mr. Lazar:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") requests from Christian Berthelsen, of The Wall Street Journal; Benjamin Jaccarino, of Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson, LLP; and Alan Katz, of Bloomberg News. The requesters seek access to records, reports, and other information referenced, relied upon, or considered by the CFTC during its investigation into the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records provided to the CFTC that are responsive to these requests.

We have determined that most of the information must be released under the FOIA. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Additionally, some information could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy within the meaning of Exemption 7(C) of the FOIA. This information has been redacted. This letter constitutes advance notice of our intent to release the documents with the proposed redactions.

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA requests and a copy of the responsive documents with proposed redactions. If you disagree with our determination, you have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to provide written justification for determining any portion of the records confidential. You may submit your comments via email to Kylie Polson at kpolson@cftc.gov. If we do not receive a written objection within the ten-day period, the records will be released.

oan E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

April 18, 2014

Christian Berthelsen The Wall Street Journal 1211 Avenue of the Americas, New York, NY 10036

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver market price manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen:

This is our second response to your request dated October 11, 2013, under the Freedom of Information Act seeking access to copies of any records, documents, files, reports, emails, or other written or recorded communications and records or evidence pertaining to the Commission's investigation into allegations of manipulation in the silver market. This would include, but is not limited to, the Commission's official case file, recordings or transcripts of the Commission's weekly market monitoring meeting at which the investigation was discussed and any reports generated by independent consultants or other outside experts contracted to review evidence collected during the inquiry. In accordance with the FOIA and agency policy, we have searched our records, as of October 17, 2013, the date we received your request in our FOIA office.

We have reviewed 39 pages of responsive records for this production, and I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of these pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure under Exemption 4, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4), because they constitute confidential commercial or financial information. *See also Critical Mass Energy Project* v. *NRC*, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Other portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 5. The exempted portions contain staff analyses, opinions, or recommendations, which are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making processes. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see also NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Finally, some portions are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 39 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

**FOIA Office** 

April 30, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided Ken Raisler of Sullivan & Cromwell LLP, on behalf of his client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, notice to submit a detailed written justification of their request for confidential treatment, See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). They have ten (10) business days from the date of this letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

A copy of the letter is enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sinceré

dan 🖰 Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

April 30, 2014

Kenneth M. Raisler Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004-2498 raislerk@sullcrom.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Raisler:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and is exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly marked "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="kpolson@cftc.gov">kpolson@cftc.gov</a> or via mail to: Kylie Polson, Office of General Counsel, Commodity futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center, 1155 21st ST NW, Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="mailto:Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If you have any questions please contact Kylie Polson at 202-4185781.

Jøan El Fina

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

May 19, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This is our third response to your October 11, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 1,721 pages of responsive records for this production, and I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Eight hundred thirteen pages are fully exempt, and portions of the other pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Some records contain personal information, which is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 6 because an individuals' right to privacy outweighs the general public's interest in seeing personal identifying information. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6); see The Lakin Law Firm v. FTC, 352

F.3d 1122 (7th Cir. 2003). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 908 pages of records. Per your conversation with Kylie Polson this morning, we are emailing 418 pages of the accessible records, and will send the remaining pages overnight on CD. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincere

MI Pina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

May 22, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided William Schroeder of Sullivan & Cromwell LLP, on behalf of his client, JPMorgan Chase Bank notice to submit a detailed written justification for their request for confidential treatment. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). They have ten (10) business days from the date of the letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension of time to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

A copy of the letter is enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

oan II. Fina

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

May 22, 2014

William Schroeder Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004-2498 schroederw@sullcrom.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Schroeder:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and is exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="kpolson@cftc.gov">kpolson@cftc.gov</a> or via mail to : Kylie Polson, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="https://christian.berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

Assistant General Counsel

cc: Kenneth Raisler

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.eftc.gov

May 22, 2014

Paul Wagner Northwest Territorial Mint P.O. Box 2148 Auburn, WA 98071-2148 paul.wagner@nwtmint.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Wagner:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided to the CFTC that are responsive to the request.

We have determined that most of the information must be released under the FOIA. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA, and that information has been redacted. This letter constitutes advance notice of our intent to release the documents with the proposed redactions.

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with proposed redactions. If you disagree with our determination, you have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to provide written justification for determining any portion of the records confidential. You may submit your comments via email to Kylie Polson at kpolson@cftc.gov. If we do not receive a written objection within the ten day period, the records will be released.

Sincere



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

May 23, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided JPMorgan Chase Bank, through their representative, William Schroeder of Sullivan & Cromwell LLP, notice to submit a detailed written justification for their request for confidential treatment. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). JPMorgan Chase Bank has ten (10) business days from the date of the letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension of time to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

A copy of the letter is enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely.

Heather C. Gottry

Deputy General Counsel

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 2, 2014

William Schroeder Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004-2498 schroederw@sullcrom.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Schroeder:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to I7 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="kpolson@cftc.gov">kpolson@cftc.gov</a> or via mail to: Kylie Polson, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21st Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="https://christian.berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

MIN FO

Joan E. Fina

Assistant General Counsel

cc: Kenneth Raisler



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 2, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided William Schroeder of Sullivan & Cromwell LLP, on behalf of his client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, notice to submit a detailed written justification for their request for confidential treatment. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). They have ten (10) business days from the date of the letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension of time to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

A copy of the letter is enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerel

Joan E. Fina

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 11, 2014

Daniel Shaver, Chief Counsel United States Mint 801 9<sup>th</sup> Street, N.W. Washington, DC 20220-1234 daniel.shaver@usmint.treas.gov

RE: Freedom of Information Act

Consultation (Our Reference No. 14-

00001-FOIA)

Dear Mr. Shaver:

Attached are 247 pages of information that is responsive to a request under the Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA"), 5 U.S.C. § 552, dated October 11, 2013, and received October 17, 2013, from Christian Berthelsen of the Wall Street Journal, who seeks access to: copies of any records, documents, files, reports, emails, or other written or recorded communications and records or evidence pertaining to the Commission's investigation into allegations of manipulation in the silver market. This would include, but is not limited to, the Commission's official case file, recordings or transcripts of the Commission's weekly market monitoring meeting at which the investigation was discussed and any reports generated by independent consultants or other outside experts contracted to review evidence collected during the inquiry.

In connection with our collection and review of the responsive records, we determined that these records contain information that originated with the United States Mint. We have completed our initial review, and I am sending these records for your consultation review.

Please provide your response by Wednesday, June 25, 2014. You may provide your response via email to Kylie Polson, the FOIA attorney processing this request, at <a href="mailto:kyliePolson">kyliePolson</a>, the FOIA attorney processing this request, at <a href="mailto:kyliePolson@cftc.gov">kyliePolson@cftc.gov</a>. If you have any questions, please contact Ms. Polson at (202) 418-5781.

V. A.

Assistant General Counsel

Attachments

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

June 18, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This is our fourth response to your October 11, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 2,333 pages of responsive records for this production. Nine hundred ninety-eight pages are exempt in full. Therefore, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, 1,335 pages of accessible records. The pages exempt in full and portions of the remaining pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Some records contain personal information, which is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 6 because an individuals' right to privacy outweighs the general public's interest in seeing personal identifying information. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6); see The Lakin Law Firm v. FTC, 352

F.3d 1122 (7th Cir. 2003). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 1,335 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

oan E Fina

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 25, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This is our fifth response to your October 11, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 86 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 86 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely,

Joan E. Fina
Assistant General Counsel

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 25, 2014

William Schroeder Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004-2498 schroederw@sullcrom.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Schroeder:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="kpolson@cftc.gov">kpolson@cftc.gov</a> or via mail to: Kylie Polson, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21st Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="mailto:Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

Sincerely,

ssistant General Counsel

cc: Kenneth Raisler



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

June 25, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided William Schroeder of Sullivan & Cromwell LLP, on behalf of his client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, notice to submit a detailed written justification for their request for confidential treatment. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). They have ten (10) business days from the date of the letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension of time to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

A copy of the letter is enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E. Fina

lincereľy

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

July 2, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This is our sixth response to your October 11, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 247 pages of responsive records for this production. One hundred fifty-six pages are exempt in full. Therefore, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, 91 pages of accessible records. The pages exempt in full and portions of the remaining pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975).

Some records contain personal information that is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 91 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

July 18, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This is our seventh response to your October 11, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 520 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some records contain personal information that is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely/

Joan E. Fina

### ALIGORIAN STRADINGS COMMANDS

FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

August 6, 2014

William Schroeder Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004-2498 schroederw@sullcrom.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Schroeder:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="mailto:kylie Polson">kylie Polson</a>, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21st Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="mailto:Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

Joan E Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

August 6, 2014

Meredith Friedman HSBC Bank USA, N.A. Legal Department 452 Fifth Avenue, 7<sup>th</sup> Floor New York, NY 10018 meredith.l.friedman@us.hsbc.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Ms. Friedman:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided to the CFTC that are responsive to the request.

We have determined that this information must be released under the FOIA. This letter constitutes advance notice of our intent to release the documents.

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents. If you disagree with our determination, you have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to provide written justification for determining any portion of the records confidential. You may submit your comments via email to Kylie Polson at kpolson@cftc.gov. If we do not receive a written objection within the ten day period, the records will be released.

Joyn E. Fina

# THE TRACE OF THE PARTY OF THE P

**FOIA Office** 

## U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

August 6, 2014

John C. Marchese
Senior Director and Associate General Counsel
CME Group
20 South Wacker Drive
Chicago, IL 60606
John.Marchese@cmegroup.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Marchese:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records NYMEX provided to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="kpolson@cftc.gov">kpolson@cftc.gov</a> or via mail to: Kylie Polson, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="https://christian.berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

1

Sincerel



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

August 6, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided William Schroeder of Sullivan & Cromwell LLP, on behalf of his client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, and CME notice to submit a detailed written justification for their request for confidential treatment. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). They have ten (10) business days from the date of the letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension of time to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

Copies of the letters are enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

John E. Fina

# FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

August 26, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This is our eighth response to your October 11, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 336 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 157 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E. Fina Assistant General Counsel



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

September 18, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided William Schroeder of Sullivan & Cromwell LLP, on behalf of his client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, and CME notice to submit a detailed written justification for their request for confidential treatment. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). They have ten (10) business days from the date of the letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension of time to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

Copies of the letters are enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sinceré

Joan E. Fina

# FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

September 18, 2014

William Schroeder Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004-2498 schroederw@sullcrom.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Schroeder:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="mailto:kylie Polson">kylie Polson</a>, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21st Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="mailto:Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

140117

# FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

September 18, 2014

John C. Marchese Senior Director and Associate General Counsel CME Group 20 South Wacker Drive Chicago, IL 60606 John.Marchese@cmegroup.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Marchese:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records CME/NYMEX provided to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="mailto:kylie Polson">kylie Polson</a>, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21st Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="mailto:christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

Sincerely,

oan E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

October 22, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This is our ninth response to your October 11, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 406 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Two hundred forty-five pages are exempt in full, and portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 161 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely,

Joan E. Filna



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

April 10, 2015

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE:

14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided William Schroeder of Sullivan & Cromwell LLP, on behalf of his client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, notice to submit a detailed written justification for their request for confidential treatment. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). They have ten (10) business days from the date of the letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension of time to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

A copy of the letter is enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

oan E. Fina

Sincerély.



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

April 10, 2015

William Schroeder Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004-2498 schroederw@sullcrom.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Schroeder:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="mailto:kylie Polson">kylie Polson</a>, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21st Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="mailto:Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

Sincerely,/

Joan E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

May 5, 2015

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE:

14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This is our tenth response to your October 11, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 719 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 719 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely,

an E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 3, 2014

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian, Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided notices to provide detailed written justifications for requests for confidential treatment to the following: Barclays Capital, Inc.; Melvin Brosterman of Stroock & Stroock & Lavan LLP, on behalf of his client, Goldman Sachs & Company; and Sung-Hee Suh of Schulte Roth & Zabel, LLP, on behalf of her client, Jamison Capital Partners. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). They have ten (10) business days from the date of the letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension of time to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

Copies of the letters are enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely,



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 3, 2014

Timothy E. Magee, Assistant Vice President, Legal Barclays Capital, Inc.
Barclays Bank PLC
745 Seventh Avenue
New York, NY 10019
timothy.e.magee@barclays.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Magee:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="kpolson@cftc.gov">kpolson@cftc.gov</a> or via mail to: Kylie Polson, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="https://christian.berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

MILL



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

June 3, 2014

Melvin A. Brosterman Stroock & Stroock & Lavan LLP 180 Maiden Lane New York, NY 10038-4982 mbrosterman@stroock.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Brosterman:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, Goldman Sachs & Company, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="kpolson@cftc.gov">kpolson@cftc.gov</a> or via mail to: Kylie Polson, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21st Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="https://christian.berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

ANTO



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 3, 2014

Sung-Hee Suh Schulte Roth & Zabel, LLP 919 Third Avenue New York, NY 10022 sung-hee.suh@srz.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Ms. Suh:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, Jamison Capital Partners, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the

FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="mailto:kylie Polson">kylie Polson</a>, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21st Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="mailto:christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

Sincerely



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21st Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 9, 2015

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided William Schroeder of Sullivan & Cromwell LLP, on behalf of his client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, notice to submit a detailed written justification for their request for confidential treatment. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). They have ten (10) business days from the date of the letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension of time to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

A copy of the letter is enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

lgan\E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21st Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 9, 2015

William Schroeder Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004-2498 schroederw@sullcrom.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Schroeder:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Kylie Polson at <a href="mailto:kylie Polson">kpolson@cftc.gov</a> or via mail to: Kylie Polson, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, Three Lafayette Center 1155 21st Street, N.W., Washington, DC 20581. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="mailto:christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

Sincerely,

oan E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21st Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 26, 2015

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This is our eleventh response to your October 11, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 505 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 505 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely

oan E. Fina

# FOIA Office

.....

# **U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION**

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21st Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

January 29, 2016

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14

14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided William Schroeder of Sullivan & Cromwell LLP, on behalf of his client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, notice to submit a detailed written justification for their request for confidential treatment. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). They have ten (10) business days from the date of the letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension of time to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

A copy of the letter is enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Edwin J. Yoshimura at 312-596-0562.

-M/L

Jøan E. Fina

# FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

January 29, 2016

William Schroeder Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004-2498 schroederw@sullcrom.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Schroeder:

و و ساده شدند و و و

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Edwin J. Yoshimura at <a href="eyoshimura@cftc.gov">eyoshimura@cftc.gov</a> or via mail to: Edwin J. Yoshimura, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, 525 W. Monroe Street, Suite 1100, Chicago, IL 60661. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="mailto:Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

þan É. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

February 10, 2016

Christian Berthelsen
Jacob Goldstein
The Wall Street Journal
1211 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10036
Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com
Jacob.Goldstein@dowjones.com

RE: 14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Berthelsen and Mr. Goldstein:

- This letter is to notify you that, on this date, we provided William Schroeder of Sullivan & Cromwell LLP, on behalf of his client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, notice to submit a detailed written justification for their request for confidential treatment. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). They have ten (10) business days from the date of the letter to provide the Commission, and you as the requester, their detailed written justification. However, an extension of time to submit their detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2).

A copy of the letter is enclosed for your reference. If you have any questions about this process, please contact Edwin J. Yoshimura at 312-596-0562.

Sincerely.

oan E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre

1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581

Telephone: (202) 418-5105

Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

February 16, 2016

William Schroeder Sullivan & Cromwell LLP 125 Broad Street New York, NY 10004-2498 schroederw@sullcrom.com

RE: 14

14-00001-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Schroeder:

The Commodity Futures Trading Commission ("CFTC") has received a Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request from Christian Berthelsen of The Wall Street Journal seeking access to records, documents, files, reports, emails or other written communications, or evidence pertaining to the CFTC's investigation into allegations of the silver market price manipulation. We have identified and reviewed records you provided on behalf of your client, JPMorgan Chase Bank, to the CFTC pursuant to a request for confidential treatment and that are responsive to the request.

Certain information constitutes business transactions and market positions, which are prohibited from release under the Commodity Exchange Act, Section 8(a)(1), and are exempt under FOIA Exemption 3. Some information is confidential commercial or financial information within the meaning of Exemption 4 of the FOIA. Finally, some information is personal information compiled into law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy" within the meaning of FOIA Exemption 7(C). This information has been redacted. We have determined that the unredacted portions must be released under the FOIA.

This letter constitutes our notice for submission of your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment pursuant to 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). The detailed written justification must contain the reasons why the information should be withheld under the FOIA, referencing the specific FOIA exemption listed in 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(1); the applicability of any specific statutes or regulations governing the treatment of the information; the existence and applicability of prior determinations by the CFTC, other federal agencies, or courts concerning the specific FOIA exemption cited; and any additional facts and authorities deemed appropriate. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(3). Finally, your detailed written justification is a public document; however, you may submit to the CFTC supplementary confidential affidavits with your detailed written justification if necessary to convincingly demonstrate that the material should not be disclosed to the FOIA requester, including marking the portions of records that you believe are exempt from release. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(5).

Your response must be clearly market "Detailed Written Justification of FOIA Confidential Treatment Request," and must contain the FOIA request number above. You may submit your detailed written justification via email to Edwin J. Yoshimura at <a href="eyoshimura@cftc.gov">eyoshimura@cftc.gov</a> or via mail to: Edwin J. Yoshimura, Office of the General Counsel, Commodity Futures Trading Commission, 525 W. Monroe Street, Suite 1100, Chicago, IL 60661. You must also provide a copy of your detailed written justification to Christian Berthelsen at <a href="mailto:Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com">Christian.Berthelsen@wsj.com</a>. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (e)(1).

I have enclosed a copy of the FOIA request and a copy of the responsive documents with our proposed redactions. You have until no later than ten (10) business days after the date of this letter to submit your detailed written justification of your request for confidential treatment. Failure to provide a timely detailed written justification will be deemed a waiver of your opportunity to appeal an adverse determination. 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7). However, an extension to submit your detailed written justification may be granted upon request and for good cause shown. See 17 C.F.R. § 145.9 (d)(7), (e)(2). If we do not receive your detailed written justification within the ten day period, the records will be released.

Sincerely/

oan El Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

October 17, 2013

Ben Jaccarino Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP 61 Broadway, Suite 501 New York, NY 10006

RE: 14-00003-FOIA

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This letter acknowledges the receipt of your Freedom of Information Act request dated October 8, 2013 for the documents listed below:

Records relied on or considered by the CFTC in connection with its investigation into the COMEX silver market

If you should have any questions regarding your request, please contact me at 202-418-5497. In any call or future correspondence concerning the request, please refer to the following case number 14-00003-FOIA.

Sincerely,

XN do CX

Paralegal Specialist

# FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

March 25, 2014

Ben Jaccarino Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP 61 Broadway, Suite 501 New York, NY 10006

RE: 14-00003-FOIA

Silver market price manipulation

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This is our first response to your request dated October 8, 2013, under the Freedom of Information Act seeking access to: all information and records reference, relied on, or considered by the Commission in connection with DOE's investigation into the COMEX silver market, beginning September 2008 and ending September 2013; all transcripts of depositions, interviews, sworn statements, or other inquiries (including exhibits and notes related thereto) concerning the investigation; all information, documents, data, records (including without limitation, large position reports, commitment of trader reports, position and transaction data, including physical, swaps, options, and futures trading data), and communications (including without limitation instant messages or "IMs") concerning trading in COMEX silver futures contracts and/or trading in COMEX silver options contracts during the time period of June 26, 2007 and between March 17, 2008, and October 27, 2010; all information, trading records, communications, and other documents produced by JP Morgan and HSBC in response to Commission subpoenas relating to the possible manipulation of the COMEX silver futures and options markets; all information, trading records, communications, and other documents produced by JP Morgan and HSBC concerning COMEX silver futures and options trading on June 25, 26, 27, and 28, 2007, and August 13, 14, and 15, 2008; and all information, trading records, communications, and other documents produced by any trading platform, including but not limited to Saxo Bank, concerning COMEX silver futures and options trading on June 25, 26, 27, and 28, 2007, and August 13, 14, and 15, 2008. On February 24, 2014, you agreed to narrow the initial focus of the request to all of the types of requested information for the specific dates of June 26, 2007, and August 14 and 15, 2008. In accordance with the FOIA and agency policy, we have searched our records, as of October 17, 2013, the date we received your request in our FOIA office.

We have reviewed 223 pages of responsive records thus far, and we are continuing to review additional records. For this production, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the 37 pages of accessible records reviewed thus far. Portions of these pages, as well as 186 fully exempt pages, fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Portions of the 223 responsive pages are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirement by FOIA Exemptions 3 and 4. First, some information is exempt under Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), because it is exempt from disclosure by another statute. Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers. Second, some information is exempt from disclosure under Exemption 4, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4), because it constitutes confidential commercial or financial information. See also Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Other portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 5. The exempted portions contain staff analyses, opinions, or recommendations, which are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making processes. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see also NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Finally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 37 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely,

an H. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

April 23, 2014

Ben Jaccarino Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP 61 Broadway, Suite 501 New York, NY 10006

RE: 14-00003-FOIA

Silver market price manipulation

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This is our second response to your October 8, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 39 pages of responsive records for this production, and I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of these pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure under Exemption 4, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4), because they constitute confidential commercial or financial information. *See also Critical Mass Energy Project* v. *NRC*, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Other portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 5. The exempted portions contain staff analyses, opinions, or recommendations, which are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making processes. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see also NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Finally, some portions are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 39 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely

pan El Fina

## FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

May 20, 2014

Ben Jaccarino Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP 61 Broadway, Suite 501 New York, NY 10006

RE: 14-00003-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This is our third response to your October 8, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 1,721 pages of responsive records for this production, and I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Eight hundred thirteen pages are fully exempt, and portions of the other pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Some records contain personal information, which is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 6 because an individuals' right to privacy outweighs the general public's interest in seeing personal identifying information. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6); see The Lakin Law Firm v. FTC, 352 F.3d 1122 (7th Cir. 2003). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 908 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerel

Joan E. Kina

## FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 18, 2014

Ben Jaccarino Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP 61 Broadway, Suite 501 New York, NY 10006

RE: 14-00003-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This is our fourth response to your October 8, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 2,333 pages of responsive records for this production. Nine hundred ninety-eight pages are exempt in full. Therefore, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, 1,335 pages of accessible records. The pages exempt in full and portions of the remaining pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Some records contain personal information, which is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 6 because an individuals' right to privacy outweighs the general public's interest in seeing personal identifying information. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6); see The Lakin Law Firm v. FTC, 352 F.3d 1122 (7th Cir. 2003). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal

privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 1,335 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

oan E. Fina

## FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 26, 2014

Ben Jaccarino Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP 61 Broadway, Suite 501 New York, NY 10006 bjaccarino@lshllp.com

RE: 14-00003-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This is our fifth response to your October 8, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 86 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 86 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely,

Joan∥Ĕ. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

July 7, 2014

Ben Jaccarino
Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP
61 Broadway, Suite 501
New York, NY 10006
bjaccarino@lshllp.com

RE: 14-00003-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This is our sixth response to your October 8, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 247 pages of responsive records for this production. One hundred fifty-six pages are exempt in full. Therefore, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, 91 pages of accessible records. The pages exempt in full and portions of the remaining pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975).

Some records contain personal information that is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 91 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781

Joan E, Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

July 22, 2014

Ben Jaccarino
Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP
61 Broadway, Suite 501
New York, NY 10006
bjaccarino@lshllp.com

RE: 14-00003-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This is our seventh response to your October 8, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 520 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some records contain personal information that is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

dish

oan E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

September 5, 2014

Ben Jaccarino Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP 61 Broadway, Suite 501 New York, NY 10006 bjaccarino@lshllp.com

RE: 14-00003-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This is our eighth response to your October 8, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 336 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 157 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

October 31, 2014

Ben Jaccarino Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP 61 Broadway, Suite 501 New York, NY 10006 bjaccarino@lshllp.com

RE: 14-00003-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This is our ninth response to your October 8, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 406 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Two hundred forty-five pages are exempt in full, and portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 161 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely,

oan E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

May 28, 2015

Ben Jaccarino
Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP
61 Broadway, Suite 501
New York, NY 10006
bjaccarino@lshllp.com

RE: 14-00003-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This is our tenth response to your October 8, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 719 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 719 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

VIII

Hoah E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21st Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 26, 2015

Ben Jaccarino Lovell Stewart Halebian Jacobson LLP 61 Broadway, Suite 501 New York, NY 10006

RE:

14-00003-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Jaccarino:

This is our eleventh response to your October 8, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 505 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 505 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

1 John

## THE WALL STREET JOURNAL.

Aruna Viswanatha Reporter Tel: (202) 862 9269 Email: aruna.viswanatha@wsj.com

### FOIA Compliance Officer:

Under the Freedom of Information Act, 5 USC Section 552, I am requesting all reports of investigation from the U.S. Commodity Futures Trading Commission Office of Inspector General, from January 1, 2015 through the present, which have not been posted publicly on the website of the Office of the Inspector General at www.cftc.gov/about/officeoftheinspectorgeneral/index.htm.

I am a journalist covering aspects of the Commodity Futures Trading Commission's work, and issues raised by the agency's inspector general are of ongoing public interest.

If you have any questions about this request, I can be reached at 202.862.9269 or at aruna.viswanatha@wsj.com.

Best regards,

Aruna Viswanatha

## THE WALL STREET JOURNAL.

Aruna Yiswanatha Reporter Tel: (202) 862 9269 Email: aruna.viswanatha@wsj.com

### FOIA Compliance Officer:

Under the Freedom of Information Act, 5 USC Section 552, I am requesting all reports, including management reviews, from the U.S. Commodity Futures Trading Commission Office of Inspector General, from January 1, 2015 through the present, which have not been posted publicly on the website of the Office of the Inspector General at <a href="https://www.cftc.gov/about/officeoftheinspectorgeneral/index.htm">www.cftc.gov/about/officeoftheinspectorgeneral/index.htm</a>.

I am a journalist covering aspects of the Commodity Futures Trading Commission's work, and issues raised by the agency's inspector general are of ongoing public interest.

If you have any questions about this request, I can be reached at 202.862.9269 or at aruna.viswanatha@wsj.com.

Best regards,

Aruna Viswanatha







Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

November 13, 2015

Aruna Viswanatha The Wall Street Journal 1025 Connecticut Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20036

RE: 16-00016-FOIA

All reports of investigation from the U.S. CFTC Office of Inspector General, which have not been posted publicly on the website of the Office of the Inspector General (Date Range for Record Search: From 01/01/2015

To 10/29/2015)

### Dear Aruna Viswanatha:

This letter acknowledges the receipt of your Freedom of Information Act request dated October 29, 2015 for the documents listed below:

All reports of investigation from the U.S. CFTC Office of Inspector General, which have not been posted publicly on the website of the Office of the Inspector General (Date Range for Record Search: From 01/01/2015 To 10/29/2015)

If you should have any questions regarding your request, please contact me at 202-418-5497. In any call or future correspondence concerning the request, please refer to the following case number 16-00016-FOIA.

Sincerely,

Linda Mauldin



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

December 6, 2013

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue NW Washington, DC 20005

RE: 14-00031-FOIA

Dear Mr. Katz:

This letter acknowledges the receipt of your Freedom of Information Act request dated December 2, 2013 for the documents listed below:

All records compiled between September 2008 and September 2013 regarding the CFTC's investigation into the silver market and allegations of price manipulation. Please include all records compiled as part of the investigation that deal with market activity that might occur outside the legal scope of the CFTC to regulate.

If you should have any questions regarding your request, please contact me at (202) 418-5131. In any call or future correspondence concerning the request, please refer to the following case number 14-00031-FOIA.

Jacqueline E. Lightle

USIS Labat, Paralegal

Supporting the U.S. Commodity Futures Trading

Commission (CFTC)
Office of General Counsel

1155 21st Street, NW, Washington DC 20581, Tel: 202-418-5131



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

March 25, 2014

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue N.W. Washington, DC 20005

RE: 14-00031-FOIA

Silver market price manipulation

Dear Mr. Katz:

This is our first response to your requests dated December 2, 2013, and January 10, 2014, under the Freedom of Information Act seeking access to: all records compiled between September 2008 and September 2013 regarding the Commission's investigation into the silver market and allegations of price manipulation, including all records compiled as part of the investigation that deal with market activity that might occur outside the legal scope of the Commission's regulation; all reports produced by outside consultants as part of the Commission's investigation into allegations of silver futures price manipulation, including but not limited to the report produced by FTI, and including all report generated from the beginning of 2008 through the end of investigation in September 2013; all emails or other electronic correspondence or messages gathered from traders or other investment professionals as part of the Commission's investigation into allegations of silver futures price manipulation; and all documents related to recusals by Commission employees, including staffers and Commission members and their aides, linked to the investigation into allegations of silver futures price manipulation. In accordance with the FOIA and agency policy, we have searched our records, as of December 2, 2013, the date we received your request in our FOIA office.

We have reviewed 223 pages of responsive records thus far, and we are continuing to review additional records. For this production, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the 37 pages of accessible records reviewed thus far. Portions of these pages, as well as 186 fully exempt pages, fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Portions of the 223 responsive pages are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirement by FOIA Exemptions 3 and 4. First, some information is exempt under Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), because it is exempt from disclosure by another statute. Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers. Second, some information is exempt from disclosure under Exemption 4, 5 U.S.C.

§ 552(b)(4), because it constitutes confidential commercial or financial information. See also Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Other portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 5. The exempted portions contain staff analyses, opinions, or recommendations, which are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making processes. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see also NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Finally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 37 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

ban E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

April 24, 2014

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20005

RE: 14-00031-FOIA

Silver market price manipulation

Dear Mr. Katz:

This is our second response to your December 2, 2013, and January 10, 2014, Freedom of Information Act requests. We have reviewed 39 pages of responsive records for this production, and I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of these pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure under Exemption 4, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4), because they constitute confidential commercial or financial information. See also Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Other portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 5. The exempted portions contain staff analyses, opinions, or recommendations, which are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making processes. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see also NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Finally, some portions are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 39 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely,

Joan B. Fina Assistant General Counsel



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

May 20, 2014

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue, NW Washington, DC 20005

RE: 14-00031-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Katz:

This is our third response to your December 2, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 1,721 pages of responsive records for this production, and I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Eight hundred thirteen pages are fully exempt, and portions of the other pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and tradesecrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Some records contain personal information, which is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 6 because an individuals' right to privacy outweighs the general public's interest in seeing personal identifying information. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6); see The Lakin Law Firm v. FTC, 352 F.3d 1122 (7th Cir. 2003). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 908 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E. Fina

# FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

June 18, 2014

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue NW, Washington, DC 20005

RE: 14-00031-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Katz:

This is our fourth response to your December 2, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 2,333 pages of responsive records for this production. Nine hundred ninety-eight pages are exempt in full. Therefore, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, 1,335 pages of accessible records. The pages exempt in full and portions of the remaining pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Some records contain personal information, which is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 6 because an individuals' right to privacy outweighs the general public's interest in seeing personal identifying information. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6); see The Lakin Law Firm v. FTC, 352 F.3d 1122 (7th Cir. 2003). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 1,335 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

I VY



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 26, 2014

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20005 akatz5@bloomberg.net

RE:

14-00031-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Katz:

This is our fifth response to your December 2, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 86 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

For this response, we are providing access to 86 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylic Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

July 7, 2014

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20005 akatz5@bloomberg.net

RE: 14-00031-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Katz:

This is our sixth response to your December 2, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 247 pages of responsive records for this production. One hundred fifty-six pages are exempt in full. Therefore, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, 91 pages of accessible records. The pages exempt in full and portions of the remaining pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975).

Some records contain personal information that is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 91 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

I F Him



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

July 22, 2014

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20005 akatz5@bloomberg.net

RE: 14-00031-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Katz:

This is our seventh response to your December 2, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 520 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some records contain personal information that is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

half

oan W. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

September 5, 2014

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20005 akatz5@bloomberg.net

RE: 14-00031-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Katz:

This is our eighth response to your December 2, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 336 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

For this response, we are providing access to 157 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

October 31, 2014

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20005 Akatz5@bloomberg.net

RE: 14-00031-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Katz:

This is our ninth response to your December 2, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 406 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Two hundred forty-five pages are exempt in full, and portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 161 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781

Sincerely

Joan E. Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

May 28, 2015

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20005 Akatz5@bloomberg.net

RE: 14-00031-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Katz:

This is our tenth response to your December 2, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 719 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

For this response, we are providing access to 719 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E. Fina Assistant General Counsel



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 26, 2015

Alan Katz Bloomberg News 1399 New York Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20005

RE: 14-00031-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Mr. Katz:

This is our eleventh response to your December 2, 2013, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 505 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

For this response, we are providing access to 505 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

March 21, 2014

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square New York, NY 10036

RE: 14-00076-FOIA

Silver market price manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

On March 17, 2014 we received your request dated the same under the Freedom of Information Act seeking access to any and all records concerning the Commission's investigation into allegations of the manipulation of the silver market between January 2007 and December 2013. On March 19, 2014, you requested a fee waiver for any charges incurred by this request.

We are granting your request for a fee waiver since we have found that the disclosure of the information you requested is likely to contribute significantly to public understanding of the operations or activities of the government and that the request is not primarily in your organization's commercial interests. See 5 U.S.C. § 552 (a)(4)(A)(i) and (iii).

If you have any questions about the way we are handling your request or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E. Fina Counsel

# FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.eftc.gov

March 25, 2014

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square New York, NY 10036

RE: 14-00076-FOIA

Silver market price manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

This is our first response to your request dated March 17, 2014, under the Freedom of Information Act seeking access to all documents related to the Commission's investigation into allegations of silver market manipulation between January 2007 and December 2013. In accordance with the FOIA and agency policy, we have searched our records, as of March 17, 2014, the date we received your request in our FOIA office.

We have reviewed 223 pages of responsive records thus far, and we are continuing to review additional records. For this production, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the 37 pages of accessible records reviewed thus far. Portions of these pages, as well as 186 fully exempt pages, fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Portions of the 223 responsive pages are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirement by FOIA Exemptions 3 and 4. First, some information is exempt under Exemption 3, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3), because it is exempt from disclosure by another statute. Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers. Second, some information is exempt from disclosure under Exemption 4, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4), because it constitutes confidential commercial or financial information. See also Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Other portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 5. The exempted portions contain staff analyses, opinions, or recommendations, which are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making processes. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see also NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Finally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which

"could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 37 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

an E. Fina

Sincerely.



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

April 23, 2014

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square, New York, NY 10036

RE: 14-00076-FOIA

Silver market price manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

This is our second response to your March 17, 2014, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 39 pages of responsive records for this production, and I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of these pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure under Exemption 4, 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4), because they constitute confidential commercial or financial information. See also Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Other portions of the responsive pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 5. The exempted portions contain staff analyses, opinions, or recommendations, which are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making processes. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see also NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

For this response, we are providing access to 39 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely

Joan E. Fina Assistant General Counsel

# FOIA Office

## U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

May 20, 2014

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square New York, NY 10036

RE: 14-00076-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

This is our third response to your March 17, 2014, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 1,721 pages of responsive records for this production, and I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Eight hundred thirteen pages are fully exempt, and portions of the other pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Some records contain personal information, which is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 6 because an individuals' right to privacy outweighs the general public's interest in seeing personal identifying information. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6); see The Lakin Law Firm v. FTC, 352 F.3d 1122 (7th Cir. 2003). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 908 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

/WIL:

# FOIA Office

### U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 18, 2014

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square New York, NY 10036

RE: 14-00076-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

This is our fourth response to your March 17, 2014, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 2,333 pages of responsive records for this production. Nine hundred ninety-eight pages are exempt in full. Therefore, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, 1,335 pages of accessible records. The pages exempt in full and portions of the remaining pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). However, we are discretionarily releasing portions of those records.

Some records contain personal information, which is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 6 because an individuals' right to privacy outweighs the general public's interest in seeing personal identifying information. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(6); see The Lakin Law Firm v. FTC, 352 F.3d 1122 (7th Cir. 2003). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal

privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 1,335 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan El Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

June 26, 2014

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square New York, NY 10036 josephine.mason@thomsonreuters.com

RE: 1

14-00076-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

This is our fifth response to your March 17, 2014, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 86 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

For this response, we are providing access to 86 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E. Rina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

July 7, 2014

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square New York, NY 10036 josephine.mason@thomsonreuters.com

RE: 14-00076-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

This is our sixth response to your March 17, 2014, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 247 pages of responsive records for this production. One hundred fifty-six pages are exempt in full. Therefore, I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, 91 pages of accessible records. The pages exempt in full and portions of the remaining pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975).

Some records contain personal information that is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 91 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E. Fina Assistant General Counsel

# FOIA Office

## U.S. COMMODITY FUTURES TRADING COMMISSION

Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

July 21, 2014

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square New York, NY 10036 josephine.mason@thomsonreuters.com

RE: 14-00076-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

This is our seventh response to your March 17, 2014, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 520 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some records contain personal information that is exempt from release under FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E. Fina Assistant General Counsel



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124

www.cftc.gov

September 5, 2014

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square New York, NY 10036 josephine.mason@thomsonreuters.com

RE: 14-00076-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

This is our eighth response to your March 17, 2014, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 336 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

For this response, we are providing access to 157 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan & Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

October 31, 2014

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square New York, NY 10036 josephine.mason@thomsonreuters.com

RE: 14-00076-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

This is our ninth response to your March 17, 2014, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 406 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Two hundred forty-five pages are exempt in full, and portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

Some responsive records contain staff analyses, opinions, and recommendations. Those portions are deliberative and pre-decisional and are an integral part of the agency's decision making process. They are exempt from the FOIA's disclosure requirements by FOIA Exemption 5. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(5); see NLRB v. Sears, Roebuck & Co., 421 U.S. 132 (1975). Additionally, portions of the pages are exempt from disclosure by FOIA Exemption 7(C), which provides protection for personal information in law enforcement records, the disclosure of which "could reasonably be expected to constitute an unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(7)(C).

For this response, we are providing access to 161 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Sincerely/

Joan H Fina



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

May 28, 2015

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square New York, NY 10036 josephine.mason@thomsonreuters.com

RE: 14

14-00076-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

This is our tenth response to your March 17, 2014, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 719 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

For this response, we are providing access to 719 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

Joan E. Fina Assistant General Counsel



Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21<sup>st</sup> Street, NW, Washington, DC 20581
Telephone: (202) 418-5105
Facsimile: (202) 418-5124
www.cftc.gov

June 26, 2015

Josephine Mason Thomson Reuters 3 Times Square New York, NY 10036

RE: 14-00076-FOIA

Silver Market Price Manipulation

Dear Ms. Mason:

This is our eleventh response to your March 17, 2014, Freedom of Information Act request. We have reviewed 505 pages of responsive records for this production. I am granting partial access to, and am enclosing copies of, the accessible records. Portions of the pages fall within the exemptions to the FOIA's disclosure requirements, as explained below.

Some of the responsive records are exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 3 because they are exempt from disclosure by another statute. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(3). Specifically, Section 8(a)(1) of the Commodity Exchange Act, 7 U.S.C. § 12(a)(1), prohibits the release of data or information which would disclose business transactions or market positions of any person and trade secrets or names of customers, and any data or information concerning or obtained in connection with any pending investigation of any person. Additionally, some records constitute confidential commercial or financial information, which is exempt from disclosure under FOIA Exemption 4. 5 U.S.C. § 552(b)(4); see Critical Mass Energy Project v. NRC, 975 F.2d 871, 879 (D.C. Cir. 1992).

For this response, we are providing access to 505 pages of records. We will continue to review the remaining responsive records and provide you with another response when that review is complete. If you have any questions about the way we handled your request, or about our FOIA regulations or procedures, please contact Kylie Polson at 202-418-5781.

 $M_{\rm A}$